

# **STATES OF JERSEY**

## **Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel Succession Planning within the States of Jersey Police Sub-Panel**

**FRIDAY, 15th OCTOBER 2010**

**Panel:**

Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier of St. Saviour (Chairman)  
Deputy T.M. Pitman of St. Helier (Vice-Chairman)  
Deputy J.M. Maçon of St. Saviour

**Witnesses:**

Director of Human Resources  
Deputy Chief Executive

**Also present:**

Ms. S. Power (Scrutiny Officer)

[10:14]

**Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier of St. Saviour (Chairman):**

I would like to welcome you here to yet another meeting of the Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel. We seem to be meeting a fair amount recently. We will introduce ourselves and then we will launch into the scrutiny. So, Roy Le Hérisier of St. Saviour, Chairman. Deputy?

[10:15]

**Deputy J.M. Maçon of St. Saviour:**

Deputy Jeremy Maçon of St. Saviour.

**Deputy T.M. Pitman of St. Helier:**

Deputy Trevor Pitman of St. Helier No. 1, Vice-Chairman.

**Ms. S. Power:**

Sam Power, Scrutiny Officer.

**Director of Human Resources**

Ruth Davies, Director of H.R. (Human Resources).

**Deputy Chief Executive:**

John Richardson, Deputy Chief Executive, Chief Officer Resources.

**Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier:**

Okay, thank you very much indeed. As you know the intention is to look at Succession Planning in the States of Jersey Police and we are well aware that you have got no direct jurisdiction over that, but we thought it would be a good idea to look at succession planning in general within the States because, as you well know, it is a fairly contentious issue, so I would like to welcome you in that regard. I have been asked if photos could be taken but people have said they do not want movies taken.

**Member of Public:**

Still, the question was for stills, sometimes you allow a still picture to be taken of proceedings.

**Scrutiny Officer:**

No, my email said visual privilege that has already been clarified but no that is not ...

**Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier:**

Visual was all embracing.

**Member of Public:**

Your decision, was it, Scrutiny?

**Scrutiny Officer.**

No.

**Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier:**

No, it was done in interpretation of the rules so that was the position.

**Member of Public:**

Can we ask you who the decision was made by in order to have proceedings with?

**Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier:**

No, it was done by the manager and conveyed. That has been the standard of Scrutiny.

**Member of Public:**

The manager of ...?

**Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier:**

Of Scrutiny.

**Member of Public:**

The Manager of Scrutiny.

**Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier:**

But I would have supported that position

**Member of Public:**

You would have supported it, yes.

**Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier:**

Put me down for supporting it.

**Member of Public:**

Okay.

**Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier:**

Okay?

**Member of Public:**

Thank you.

**Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier:**

Good, well we will have a look at the broader issues of succession planning in the States, so first of all I wonder if I can start. Do you have formal succession planning policies within States Human Resources?

**Director of Human Resources:**

Yes we do, there is a succession planning policy. I think it has been in place for a number of years and that sets out how departments are expected to identify requirements and then use the performance appraisal process to work with individuals and also link it into the recruitment process. So that is in place and been around for quite a while.

**Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier:**

Okay, and could you very quickly tell us, what are the key features of this policy?

**Director of Human Resources:**

Well, as I have just outlined, Sir, first of all the departments to identify against business requirements, and obviously to look at things like known departures that are coming up, so we have people who have already given notice, it might be a reasonable length of time coming or fund retirements, that sort of thing. Clearly you cannot always anticipate when there are going to be gaps. Then to consider existing people, could they be given opportunities to act up, which certainly has happened. Obviously then look at individual training and development needs using the performance appraisal process, which is in place.

**Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier:**

Okay, I will move to my colleague.

**Deputy J.M. Maçon:**

Thank you. When do the succession planning policies apply?

**Director of Human Resources:**

Well, they apply all of the time, so there is not a particular event necessary that triggers this. It should be part of the people matched business planning process. Certainly some other organisations do this in slightly different ways but it is just a normal part of how you should be managing people to deliver your business.

**Deputy J.M. Maçon:**

And then to all departments, is that right?

**Director of Human Resources:**

Yes.

**Deputy J.M. Maçon:**

Things like the airport and the harbours they have their separate, do they, HR process?

**Director of Human Resources:**

We do provide HR support to the harbours in a slightly different way to the airport at the moment anyway but no, their employees are still S.E.B. (States Employment Board) employees, they still follow the same processes.

**Deputy J.M. Maçon:**

Thank you.

**Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier:**

Okay, I will move to my colleague.

**Deputy T.M. Pitman:**

How successful would you say that the succession planning has been in the past?

**Director of Human Resources:**

Well obviously I can only comment on the period that I have been here, which is a little bit over a year, and what I perceive from that. I think some of the key things are in place, things like the Modern Manager Programme, which has been running for about 3 years I think, maybe a little bit more, has undoubtedly developed people. I think, of the first 100 people that went through that programme, 20 have achieved promotion and 5 others have been put into acting positions. So, clearly that is having some benefit, and I cannot give evidence there is a direct correlation but the number of (j) cats has gone down, as well, over the last 18 months or so. So I would say there is some evidence that some of those things are starting to work. Clearly some of them take quite a long time to work their way through the system.

**Deputy T.M. Pitman:**

A lot of people would probably over simplify, I suppose, and look at how many local people have risen through that. I presume that is an indicator on how successful it is, are there any sort of figures there?

**Director of Human Resources:**

Only the number of (j) cats, which has definitely dropped. I need to validate the latest figures but they have fallen by at least 100 since the middle of 2008.

**Deputy T.M. Pitman:**

One other point, you talked about the appraisal process. Generally I know, certainly when I worked in Education, we were forced to use professional youth work using community development like I was, the H.R. forms and the appraisal process was just the one size fits all, which was lots of it did not apply to us at all yet we were forced to use it. Has that type of thing changed now?

**Director of Human Resources:**

It will be whatever it was a year or so ago. I have not done anything to change that and ideally ... we are going to review the management development approach, this also needs to be looked at. We have done a survey, which we are still waiting for the results of, and we have another one running at the moment on capturing staff and management views of the performance appraisal process. So, at some point in among coping with the B.R.s (budget reviews) and C.S.R. (Comprehensive Spending Review) and everything else we will progress the findings of that survey.

**Deputy T.M. Pitman:**

So that is something you support, it's obviously different skills, different jobs. The police can be very different to the airport and therefore ...



**Director of Human Resources:**

Well, the principles are the same, that there should be regular conversations, that people should be clear about what their objectives are. They should be given constructive feedback and offered development. All of those things are common, and there should be a record kept, but exactly how that is then applied using which set of competencies clearly has to be appropriate to the staff group.

**Deputy T.M. Pitman:**

Is that left to the actual head of department or senior officer?

**Director of Human Resources:**

Well, certainly when you are talking about highly skilled areas, so the police have their own set of competencies, doctors, nurses and so on, then obviously it has to rest with the professionals.

**Deputy T.M. Pitman:**

Thank you.

**Deputy R. G. Le Hérissier:**

Madam witness, do you think a succession planning policy based on ultimately, if it were ever achievable, having all “locals” in senior positions is ultimately a good policy?

**Director of Human Resources:**

What I would say is that you obviously need to recruit the best people to be able to deliver what you need. It would be sad if a significant proportion of people were not being grown through, but what is really appropriate to the job will depend on the experience that is needed. It is just a fact of life of living in a small community that not all of the experiences are going to be available by just being here on the Island. So, the important thing is to work out how else can we give people some of that experience so that they do not miss out, and that is something we can have a look at. Certainly from what I am aware of in the police, which was the particular issue that I know you want to look at, I am aware that there are secondment opportunities, for example, off the Island. There are possibilities to go on courses to get exposure to some of the things that just do not happen on a regular basis here, so you cannot build up the experience. So that seems entirely appropriate to me.

**Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier:**

Some people argue that in a way you need the chemistry between local people, who can bring local knowledge and an understanding of the local environment, and people from outside who can challenge them, who can bring new ideas, and that you should really keep both those elements in place. What is your view about that?

**Director of Human Resources:**

I think that sounds sensible, that if things become too closed then clearly you could be missing out on things from somewhere else. Exactly where the right balance lies on that I could not tell you sitting here today, but I think it is always good to get new ideas in. I grew up in Wales in a time when outsiders were not very welcome. Things have changed a lot there now and embrace not just the U.K. (United Kingdom), the

whole of Europe, anywhere else, just get the good ideas from wherever you can get them from. I think that has got to be good, having a good, rich debate. So I think there would be a risk of over reliance on recruiting absolutely everybody from on the Island. So, some things just do not happen here.

**Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier:**

Yes, okay.

**Deputy T.M. Pitman:**

Does John want to chip in? Have you got any advice?

**Deputy Chief Executive:**

I will add what I can but I think Ruth has been answering the questions as you asked them.

**Deputy R. G. Le Hérissier:**

Well I will come back to the questions. One of the issues when you do set up succession planning, and it is often one of the controversial issues, is the issue of fast tracking candidates. What is your view on that?

**Director of Human Resources:**

I think you do need to be careful. There are risks, as with anything in life, you have to weigh up the risks and benefits. I think where I have seen this working is in big organisations, big set-ups where you can have a bit pool because there is always attrition. I think there are some risks around people believing they are going to be the

chosen people for the future, and sometimes performance drops off as a result of that. So I think it needs to be handled with care. Certainly, from my profession, I think these kind of closed approaches, with a certain number of people who have been labelled as the successful people for the future, has fallen out of fashion and the approach these days is much more of really trying to help everybody achieve their full potential. Certainly keep a watchful eye on the number of people in a particular pool, so if you have got a senior job that you know is going to come up, coming back to the police example, senior people are appointed on fixed term contracts, so you know there is going to be a point in time, and so you try and grow enough people to give you confidence there is at least one good person in that pool, rather than perhaps the old fashioned traditional fast track approach. Also there are risks if you do that in a small environment because you could invest a lot of money and lose people along the way.

**Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier:**

Yes, one of the ideas implemented to a point in Jersey was that - and of course it is a direct import from the old administrator class - is that you get generalists and at a certain point in your career you become a generalist and you can deal with broader issues, and you get put in that pool. You are thought to have the ability to work within virtually every government department. Do you agree with that philosophy?

**Director of Human Resources:**

I do not I am afraid, and I think it is something that has changed quite a lot in the U.K. civil service recently, and that has become a much stronger recognition of the value of having professional people leaving the professions. It is quite interesting, I was

having a quick read through Sir Philip Green's report on efficiencies in Government in the U.K., and he is making a lot of having procurement professionals and how much has been wasted, and property management specialists. So I think there is a growing recognition of the need to have professionals rather than generalists. I think there is a risk that people move around a lot and never quite master anything.

**Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier:**

Yes, okay, I will move to my colleague ... sorry, Trevor.

**Deputy T.M. Pitman:**

I just wondered if you could say what safeguards are in place because obviously there is quite a perception over here that, you know, jobs for the boys, the Jersey way. I can certainly say from my experience in the past that there was a group of people that ... they all went skiing together for instance. Now, what sort of protection is in place to say that that is not the very clique, so you are looking for the best man or woman for the job instead of: "I am particularly good mates with Deputy Le Hérisier".

**Director of Human Resources:**

What I would say, that I think this is one of the areas that I can see an awful lot of work has been done. The Jersey Appointments Commission and their code of practice is hugely influential, and certainly for the senior jobs, that simply could not happen that someone offered a job to a friend, because the whole process is geared around fairness and openness. There are set some people who have to be on the senior panels, the panels are always chaired by an appointments commissioner for the very senior levels, I get involved in those, and this is all based on competencies to do

the job. In fact it is not just based on an interview these days either, there are various elements, more of an assessment centre approach, and below that level managers have to be trained and there is a kind of pass or fail approach to the training for recruitment. So again, it takes time for these things to work their way through, but I have a reasonable degree of confidence that it is much harder ... if that was a practice of the past it would be much harder for that to be successful now.

[10:30]

**Deputy T.M. Pitman:**

Could I just enlarge on one point that Deputy Le Hérissier raised, is there a danger that with everything focused on cost cutting and business plans, especially something like the police, and I do not want to talk about the police specifically, but that we get away from policing skills and crime reduction because there is so much focus you have got to have an individual who can get more for less, et cetera? Is there a danger of that sort of erosion of what would be a fundamental, I suppose, reason to be of certain jobs?

**Director of Human Resources:**

I really cannot comment on the police, I think that is an issue for you to ask the senior officer. It is a general principle around cost cutting. I think in some ways it can offer more opportunities to people because it can open things up a little bit and give more opportunity, but there is a risk as always of some of the things that can be cut are the very things around training development and succession. I would say that would now

be HR directive. I think there are risks that some of things are seen as easy targets sometimes, and there is a longer term impact clearly of cutting too much.

**Deputy T.M. Pitman:**

Okay, I will move to our colleague

**Deputy J.M. Maçon:**

Yes, you touched on the Modern Managers Programme; what are the main training and development policies that underpin succession planning?

**Director of Human Resources:**

Well obviously in the professions they will have their own, so again if you look at the police, doctors, nurses, they will have their own set of competencies and set professional standards that have to be met, and they will have their own approach to doing that. So, the generic ones for the States of Jersey are much more around developing management and leadership skills because as you move up the organisation clearly, apart from some jobs, which are deep professional senior people, you have to get better at managing other people and providing them with leadership. So that is where the focus has been, so the Modern Manager Programme and the Future Leaders Programme.

**Deputy J.M. Maçon:**

What is a leadership skill?

**Director of Human Resources:**

What is a leadership skill? I would sum that up as the ability to set direction, set clear objectives, support and enable other people to achieve those objectives. So, particularly in difficult times, as we are going through at the moment, the ability to keep people motivated and able to perform and deliver, despite everything that is going on around them, is a leadership skill.

**Deputy Chief Executive:**

Can I say, just to pick up, or follow on really, from what Ruth was saying in terms of succession planning. I think we should also just be aware of that it goes further down into the organisation, and just comment on the States Apprenticeship Scheme that we had many years ago, then it fell by the wayside and, in recent years, we have picked it up again. Certainly in my previous department it was an area where we had great success. So, we were training not just professional people, we were training local people in crafts in a number of areas and it has worked extremely well. I think the thing that would make me quite proud about it is that when I first started in the States I can remember the apprentices I took on, and I am looking now at seeing an awful lot of vans driving round the Island with those people now running their own business, and I think that is just a great mark that we have got some fantastic staff that stayed within the States and are now working at senior level in the sort of technician trades area, which is excellent, but also a number of those have branched out on their own accord and are now running their own businesses very successfully. There are one or 2 real success stories there, and I think it is just the mark of the level and the quality of training that we have provided in the past, and I am very pleased to say we are now providing again through apprenticeship schemes.



**Director of Human Resources:**

There are 2 other ones that are worth mentioning, one is in Health with training nurses, and the other one is the secretarial scheme. It might sound a bit odd but it has been very difficult to recruit secretarial staff, not general admin staff but people with secretarial skills, and there is a very good scheme that is running. In fact we have had a number of them through my own department. So I think there are a lot of good things going on.

**Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier:**

I wonder if I can come back to you, John, and bring back some of the points we have raised with Ms. Davies? Do you feel succession planning has worked in the States?

**Deputy Chief Executive:**

I think there are areas where you can definitely see it has worked.

**Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier:**

Yes, and areas where it has not?

**Deputy Chief Executive:**

Well areas where it comes down to, and Ruth has already mentioned it, the expertise that is required and the breadth of knowledge. In that there are some areas where I can see success, and there are some where I can see we nearly got there through local training and development, but we did not quite make it for some individuals because we could not give them the opportunity to get off Island to get breadth of experience. Certainly, in speaking from my past experience within the department, there was a

point where we had trained an individual to a fairly high level and they had achieved all the professional qualifications, but they did not quite have the breadth of experience in that relevant profession, and the only way they could get it was by going off Island and working for a major contractor or something, because it was in engineering.

**Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier:**

So what happened at that point?

**Deputy Chief Executive:**

We found a route to getting them there, in that we certainly found a large company in the U.K. who were prepared to take the staff, but when we looked at the costs involved for the individual, and the fact that they would have to go off for 18 months, 2 years on a major project or contract to get that experience, for family reasons, et cetera, we just could not quite get them there. So, some very good success stories, which I am very proud of, but I can think of 3 or 4 staff that have moved up and broadened their horizons significantly and one or 2, which it is just a shame we did not quite get there. The opportunity was there but it came down very much to financial matters and personal circumstances because of the commitment that they had to give for themselves and within their own family circumstances to be able to move away for a couple of years.

**Deputy T.M. Pitman:**

Obviously that is a question I want to ask when we talk to the police themselves, but is that a major contributing factor then, that people really, perhaps through genuine

difficulties, they do not want to go and have that 2 years off Island because it is very difficult perhaps for family circumstances?

**Deputy Chief Executive:**

I think yes, if they wanted to do it and because they could see the benefit they would gain while they were working on this particular project we had lined up for them to go and work on, but they ended up having to say: “Look, I am sorry but I really cannot make that break to be away from home for so long.”

**Deputy T.M. Pitman:**

What sort of degree of support did the States give to such people? Because obviously it is in our interests if we can employ local people eventually.

**Deputy Chief Executive:**

We were certainly happy to provide return airfares every, I think it is 3 weeks, one weekend in 3 or it would be a sort of fairly set procedure for doing it, but when it comes down to an employee who was, I think in this particular case, a sort of late 20s early 30s with a very young family to be away 5 nights, it was down to very much private circumstances, which I could understand at the time. We just could not quite make it work at the time unfortunately but it was one of those opportunities, which was a shame, because we could not just give those one or 2 individuals that one little opportunity, which would have probably given them a much broader horizon.

**Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier:**

So, given those sorts of perennial domestic issues, does that mean it is impossible almost, to prepare people in sufficient numbers to succeed?

**Deputy Chief Executive:**

No, I do not think I would say it was impossible, but it is one of the factors you have just got to be aware of and then see whether there are other opportunities, other ways of doing it. So I would not say it is impossible but it is a tie definitely, you have just got to be aware of it.

**Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier:**

The other alternative is to sort of more aggressively recruit people who have gone away and may or may not be wishing to come back. Now, sometimes that works, sometimes that does not, but would you do that?

**Deputy Chief Executive:**

Well, I targeted, because I had a particular - and I am speaking very much not from this role but from my previous role - area because I was very short of professional electrical engineers, and I targeted people who were leaving Jersey to go away on university courses and degrees in engineering, and targeted them and offered them work experience during the summer holidays, albeit to try to coax them back there, get a working relationship with us so they could see there was a career path. Unfortunately, I think at the time I was doing it there were only 2 who were on courses that were suitable and they clearly had their eyes set, and good luck to them, on much bigger and broader careers so I was unable to do it. But that is the way you have got to try and get in early, work with Highlands or work with the Education

Department, see who is going away on specific courses that meet your requirements 3 to 5 years down the line, and try to provide opportunity for them when they come back in work experience.

**Deputy T.M. Pitman:**

Ruth has certainly touched on it already, but is it totally unrealistic to expect that we will ever get to the stage where all senior positions are filled by local applicants given our small geographic?

**Director of Human Resources:**

I think we can choose to do that, whether or not they then have the range of knowledge and so on is another question. Of course you could decide to have a policy that you are not going to recruit anybody from off the Island. I think there are risks associated with that.

**Deputy Chief Executive:**

Yes, I would agree, I think the reality is that there are very few senior people local. Certainly if I think of all the local staff who are in senior positions, there are very few that I can think of that have not had significant experience away from the Island to get that breadth, and then fortunately have come back again. So, to recruit locally, train locally, without giving them an opportunity of going off, not necessarily to the U.K. but Europe or wherever, to get a broader range of experience I think it would be a missed opportunity, and it would be a risk to the States for not having that breadth.

**Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier:**

Have you studied jurisdictions where it appears that that policy has been more aggressively pursued?

**Director of Human Resources:**

I have not, I am afraid, no.

**Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier:**

Of course there are some who make a great point about that and then they would bring in their outside expertise in terms of a visiting consultant or something like that, because it has also been argued to me we bring people in and it is great bringing people in for 5 years “before they go native”. In other words, you have got them with fresh ideas, they can shake up the organisation, they can bring in fresh thinking, and hopefully prepare their successor. Do you approach the problem in that way also?

**Director of Human Resources:**

Absolutely, and I think there is scope for working quite creatively, not just from off the Island, but there are other private sector businesses on the Island, and that is one of the things that I have been looking at in my own function, of how can you get the best of some of that alongside people who work for the States supplemented by, where necessary, some other expertise from off the Island, and that helps the businesses locally also learn a little bit from the people who come in as well as your own staff. So, there are lots more that we can do to be creative around this.

**Deputy J.M. Maçon:**

Moving on now, how do you feel that the balance between the Nolan principles and succession planning, how is this achieved? Because the Nolan principles go for obviously a very objective, there is a formula whereas ... and anyone can apply and go for a job, whereas if you have had someone who you had been training and building up for a long time, how would you strike a balance between that?

**Director of Human Resources:**

That is quite an interesting topic that we are discussing with the Appointments Commission. I have a piece of work that has just started with the chair of the Appointments Commission, but in principle, coming back to the broader issues, you can do that. I have worked in 2 other organisations where there have been slightly different approaches to that. You can still, if you go for the talent pool approach, then what you are doing is growing people but you still go through a formal process to pick the best one of them. So, you are paying attention to succession planning, you are identifying people with potential to move to the next level, you are investing in their development, but you are not promising them a job at the end of it, and that is quite a common way of getting the balance between succession planning but not actually sort of saying: "It is you" next time a position comes up. Another way is just having much greater flexibility where sometimes you identify particular roles and you say those roles will be filled in a developmental way, and everybody knows that and everybody knows that these ... this was in a much bigger organisation, about twice the size of the whole of the States of Jersey, so we have much more flexibility to be able to do that. So I think the talent pool approach can certainly work here where you develop a number of people and then pick the best one out of that when a vacancy arises.

**Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier:**

There was such a programme, as you know, the Templeton Programme, which I am sure John Richardson has briefed you about, which had elements of what you have spoken about.

[10:45]

If somebody told you: “Look, it is a political priority, we have to get to grips with this issue of localisation. We have made a lot of promises.” Just say somebody put this point of view to you, I am sure you have heard it before. We have had a lot of promises, the programme has not worked, we stagger from one sort of outside appointment to another because, as John said, we have never quite got there despite perhaps a lot of good intentions along the way. If somebody said: “Look, put a proper localisation programme in place and one that will work” how would you go about that?

**Director of Human Resources:**

I would go back to looking at each of the specific areas and do a realistic assessment against what is available on the Island and say: “How many of these do we think we can do that with?” Then look at the next lot and say: “What more could we do to grow more people locally?” Then blend up with the smaller group where you say: “Well, it is going to be extremely difficult to do this.” But at least then you would have clarity of where we should be automatically finding people locally.

**Deputy T.M. Pitman:**



How much is the possibility of demoralising local applicants taken into account from these processes? Because I think from my own experience, I have 3 principal officers, every one of them each time was meant to be a local person and each time it was only sadly, you know, they died most of them, you know, which was nothing to laugh about but it is just the way the process went. We had 3 - fortunately the current one is still alive, but I mean when people see constantly again there is someone being brought in, how do you safeguard against people's ... not the second best, but: "Well, I am never going to get to the top" so people go stale and do not ...

**Director of Human Resources:**

Yes, it is a common problem in any organisation quite honestly, and that happens all the time that people are disappointed and do not get jobs that they had hoped to get. Certainly in my last organisation we invested a lot in giving those people face-to-face feedback and working with them then on a realistic development plan. So, one that either gave them an opportunity to be refreshed and re-energised and find something else that they were passionate about doing, if they genuinely were never going to make it. Some people do have ceilings, not everybody gets to be Chief Executive. Or, if it is just that there is a gap, then put a development plan in to help them so that they should be more successful next time round. Give them a coach or a mentor or whatever else, but all of these things cost money, so there are no free answers to some of these things. If you are really serious about doing it you have to put investment in, and it takes people's time but I have seen that work well.

**Deputy J.M. Maçon:**

On a wider States business programme, the C.S.R. programme, how or will that impact upon training?

**Director of Human Resources:**

It has not so far. We do not have a huge training budget, so there was not an awful lot to cut, but I think what we have to do is do a bit of a stock take, and part of my plan for the next sort of 6 months or so is to really assess what do we need, and then I will have to make a case for appropriate investment. Whether or not I get that will be another thing, but it is always a mistake to cut too much around this just to save money quickly. I do not think that is the intention of what we are trying to do at the moment. There is an argument you need to invest more in some areas as you go through a process of quite significant change.

**Deputy Chief Executive:**

I would add to that, I think that is one of the crucial parts that is coming out of the C.S.R. programme, is that if we are going to move to a leaner, more efficient organisation then quite a lot of investment needs to be made with the staff to help them move into that new area of work. So, far from cutting that budget, I think part of the investment in delivering C.S.R. is going to be about training and skilling staff in the right areas because there might well be some gaps that the Island cannot cover as we move through the delivery side of it.

**Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier:**

But of course the other side is, John, obviously if you do shrink the organisation and you follow what the public wants, who as you know have this picture that the

organisation is over-staffed, particularly at the middle levels, it is going to have an impact as well. What sort of impact do you think it will have?

**Deputy Chief Executive:**

Well, that is really following on from what I have been saying. I think as we start looking at various delivery programmes for savings, it is not just about delivering the savings package, it is about making sure that what is left in the organisation to deliver those frontline services is properly structured, and the staff that are there to deliver them are properly trained. Then I think there will definitely be areas where we need to deliver some more training and more development for staff. In one area, in particular, in formalised project management, is that because we move through cycles in the States in terms of how we deliver programmes, there is a lack of structured project management and programme management training, and it is one that we will be looking at. Certainly we are running some courses now and I think they have been quite successful. A fairly high level starting point, but it is something we need to develop.

**Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier:**

Okay, what about if we ever get to that organisational paradise, in a way, where the organisation is flattened, that of course will have implications for managers and supervisors and so forth and, as Trevor said before, for staff morale? How do you think we should deal with that?

**Deputy Chief Executive:**

When you start looking at, however you want to describe it, de-layering, flattening, whatever, then there are certain functions that operational managers still have to provide, and it covers delivering that frontline service to the public, as well as taking on some of these management administrative roles that might have otherwise been done by others in the past. There comes a point where you cannot just layer on more and more work without changing the way in which you go about doing that work. So a lot of it is going to be about investment in systems to make life easier for them, and changing the way we do things administratively. I can give you a very simple practical example is managing timesheets for staff. At the moment it is a manual process. If we can automate that through electronic process it will save a lot of time and efficiency in terms of staff time, checking manual sheets then inputting, et cetera. I think I have worked it out once from a manual worker timesheet being filled in by the manual worker to the point of paying that person is 14 separate steps and interventions. Now, if you automate that you immediately get (1) efficiency out of it but (2) systems. Investment in systems will help you deliver that.

**Deputy J.M. Maçon:**

Just to ask, because obviously we know about the wonderful improvements that were done to the H.R. system, which did not quite come to pass, how do you feel that the States going forward will deal with upgrades and system change so that the States gets what it wants?

**Deputy Chief Executive:**

I think we are at a point now where, looking as I have just described, at generating efficiency and generating new ways of working to make sure that staff who are

providing that frontline service are not layered with too much administrative work, we need to start looking at more flexible, more modern systems that will help them do it. So that is the piece of work we will be doing as part of the delivery programme for C.S.R.

**Deputy T.M. Pitman:**

I know you are both not here to discuss the police service itself, but obviously the appointment of Police Chief is probably quite unique compared with progression in other areas. Is the fact that it comes ultimately down to a recommendation by the Minister and then it comes to the States, is there any less of a safeguard in how that person is appointed then than will be in other departments?

**Director of Human Resources:**

No, it is exactly the same, chaired by an Appointments Commissioner. We have just recently been going through the process, there are 2 Appointments Commissioners involved. I have been involved. So it is exactly the same degree of rigour that is attached to the appointment before it comes to yourselves and the States.

**Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier:**

One of the issues, it will obviously arise - will very obviously arise with the Police Chief and it arises with other appointments - is I suppose the peculiarities of working in Jersey, to use a euphemism. How do you deal with that in the appointment process?

**Director of Human Resources:**

I think there are various approaches. From personal experience I would say you cannot know until you get here, but there are various briefing sessions, information giving sessions. We have also, as you know, because I know you have been part of them yourselves, we have a session with politicians. We also have a session, as appropriate, with other senior people. So, for a chief officer you would have other chief officers, particularly newer chief officers, who have perhaps been through the process themselves, to give the candidates the opportunity to ask as many questions as they like. “What was it like for you?” “What is different about being here?” We do our best to give a flavour, and it depends where people are coming from and what experiences they have had before as to how big the gap is.

**Deputy T.M. Pitman:**

Something that has just occurred to me, it is probably very difficult to answer, is there anything that is done to guard against people who perhaps might come to Jersey because it is such a little backwater? It is a nice step back; it is going to be a nice easy life.

**Director of Human Resources:**

That is what comes back to the fundamentals of the recruitment process again. If you get that right you will flush out any things like that that might be cause for concern, and right from the very beginning you have the post to advertise. I mean it used to be advertised with lots of pictures of sunsets over the sea and so on, and we have made a deliberate decision on a number of senior appointments not to do that, and to make sure people know that this is challenging. There are lots of things that will need to be addressed. We are looking for service improvements. We are looking for increased

performance, and this is not somewhere to come for a quiet life. You start right at the beginning and you follow that all the way through the process.

**Deputy T.M. Pitman:**

What, if I can just ask a further one, what impact, if you are considering appointing Jeremy, for instance, and then it comes out that his partner ... he is not married, it is his partner, perhaps there are kids involved, do those sort of things impact on it? Does it matter if people are married or if they want to bring a partner because obviously it is a big step to moving here?

**Director of Human Resources:**

Well obviously, as part of the orientation bit, you offer people information. I do not think we would de-select anybody on the grounds they wanted to bring anything, in particular, whether it was a partner, children or particular animals or whatever else. We would try and enable that to happen, pick the best candidate for the job. But there are issues around that obviously in terms of other people being able to work, and that is part of the decision then that the person would have to make. So, we just give people the information and it is their life choice at the end of the day. So if they are coming and their partner might not be able to work that is something that they will have to take into account.

**Deputy T.M. Pitman:**

I only asked that because I knew of one situation just a few years ago where those people got ... she got to the airport and they were faced with this. Well they were not

married, it was the girlfriend, not their ... and so they never had the interview, just went straight back, which seemed a waste of money to Jersey I think.

**Director of Human Resources:**

Absolutely. Well, we try and make sure that everybody is fully aware before they get to sign the contract, never mind get on an aeroplane.

**Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier:**

One of the big issues, and it reflects on the whole issue of bringing outsiders in because perhaps they can be more objective about the situation, but obviously - and this is where angels fear to tread - one of the big issues is the political set-up. That fact that politicians appear to be much more involved in detailed issues, and if you come like your good self from a very big jurisdiction, where there is obviously a distance, and it is said like with local candidates they will sort of, in a way, self-censor themselves because they know the situation a lot more. It might well inhibit them, they might be not willing to say: "Do not do this for fear of upsetting the local politician" or whatever. How do you deal with that in your recruitment process?

**Director of Human Resources:**

Well, part of the reason for meeting the politicians for the senior level appointments is so that people realise that from before day one, there is active involvement. As I say, we just give people information, we try and give realistic examples of what life can be like. I think that is probably one of the biggest differences in coming from ... even if you have worked for central or local government in the U.K., politics is much closer to details of what happens than just about anywhere else. All you can do is try and



describe that and ensure that people appreciate, and if that is something that they cannot cope with then this would not be the right place for them to be.

[11:00]

**Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier:**

Yes. Good, well we are coming to the end, not the end in the total sense, just the end of the session you will be glad to hear, so I will ask Jeremy and Trevor if they have got any sum up questions.

**Deputy J.M. Maçon:**

Nothing further to ask, thank you.

**Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier:**

I will ask one or 2, but are there any points you would want to make? Are there any things where you think we may have got the wrong end of the stick or we may not have given you credit for something, anything like that?

**Director of Human Resources:**

There is just something I would want to add to a question that was asked about, I think particularly about morale, when you are going through difficult times and change, and I think what I would add to that is, that the way to minimise some of that is to allow people to participate in what is happening. I think the worst thing that you can do is decree things on high and tell them that things are going to happen. So, one of the other things that we need to start putting in place is as many opportunities as

possible for staff to influence some of the change. At the end of the day nobody wants jobs to go, nobody wants some of these things to be happening, but it is better to be part of the conversation and influence where you can than not to be. So, I think that is a really important part of how we can maintain some morale anyway, as we go through. It is going to be difficult, there is no pretending otherwise.

**Deputy T.M. Pitman:**

Do you think Jersey has done a very good job of that recently?

**Director of Human Resources:**

I cannot comment.

**Deputy T.M. Pitman:**

Well you can.

**Director of Human Resources:**

Not under the banner of dealing with succession planning in the police.

**Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier:**

Well, succession planning in the broader sense, in that if we want the good people to stay in this organisation and perform effectively, surely you have got to be able to keep motivating them through hard and good times?

**Director of Human Resources:**

Absolutely, and that is why I say that is something that I think we need to do that perhaps has not been done as much as it could have been done in the past.

**Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier:**

Yes. John, have you got anything?

**Deputy Chief Executive:**

I will just carry on from what Ruth said, I think there are when you look around the States and go into the departments, there is a huge amount of commitment from the staff delivering service to the public. It is amazing, and although we have said, and it is very clear from the decision the States has taken and the publicity about C.S.R., we are facing some tough times, and it is going to be difficult, but the level of commitment for delivering those services I just see around has been amazing. I was a judge recently at another department on some award ceremony and the level of commitment from staff, and these were fairly young staff in that department, it was just incredible. It was quite a sort of moving event to be there for a day doing that process with them and go around a number of other departments. So, I think we should not lose sight of the service that we get from our staff at all levels, and the commitment that we have got, and it is one of the things we have got to retain. Yes, there are some tough times ahead, and we have got to deliver the changes and the savings that have been identified, but we must maintain that morale and make sure that the service and the quality we provide is maintained.

**Deputy T.M. Pitman:**

Just to take on from that, John, and I am sure you can answer this as Deputy Chief Executive, have chief executives, the chiefs of departments, have they done enough, because I think that what has been allowed to be played out in the media, and I know you have got no control of the media, but surely there is an opportunity to counter that. The way we have allowed public services, public sector workers, to be portrayed, is that they are all overpaid, you know, they are the cause of all our woes. Do you think that the departments have done enough? Because I know we deliver a very good service, because I know lots of public sector workers and they are very demoralised. So, surely challenging that has got to come from sort of that senior level, and politicians of course.

**Deputy Chief Executive:**

Well, I can only look inwards into the departments that I go to and I visit, and I do see a high level of commitment. I also see, understandably in this current time, a high level of concern because of where are the cuts going to be taken, how are they going to be delivered? But I do go back to the point that I still see a very motivated and very committed workforce in terms of delivering service to the public, but you have got to balance that against the understandable concerns they have got about future and jobs, et cetera. So, there is a balance to strike. Have we delivered the message? I think we have delivered as much as we can internally but, as I am sure you are aware, with a certain level of control we may not have about the external side of it.

**Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier:**

If I can ask one final question to you, John, which I asked Ms. Davies here, if a senior politician told you: “Look, we have really got to stop this flapping about around

localisation and implement it instead of this stop start policy” how would you go about it?

**Deputy Chief Executive:**

I would want to be sure that if we were going to look at just pure localisation then I think you have got to plan for it being a very long term delivery programme because if you just stop now, unless, as I have already commented on, you have got a process in place where you can get local people off Island to get that breadth of experience, I would think you would pay the price several years down the line. So, if you are going to start that then you have really got to start work on a long-term plan because you have got to start with people who are then in a position to be able to go off Island, and you are really then looking at graduates and young people without too many family or financial commitments on the Island, to be able to start having that to and fro process. So, yes I would say it is a long-term programme. To try to deliver it short term I think you would either fail very quickly or you would pay the price several years down the line.

**Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier:**

Yes, okay. Good, well thank you very much indeed both of you for attending and for giving us the benefit of your thoughts and we will now finish the session. Thank you.

[11:06]